



**CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION**

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
07 November 2018**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:08 PM, in the Board Room at the Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo.
- The meeting was called to order by Vice Chair Fetzner, and the roll was called by the Management Analyst.

ROLL CALL	Present	Absent
Michael Guarino, Chair		x
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Michael Connor (D4)		x
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzner, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

- Chairman's Statement
- Announcements
- Citizens to be heard:
 - Valerie Cortez of Dignowity Hill Concerned Citizens, 508 Lamar, Support of items remaining on the consent agenda
 - Arvis Holland of Dignowity Hill Neighborhood Associations, 1112 Lamar, Support of items remaining on the consent agenda
- The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda, which consisted of:

Item #	Case #	Consent Agenda
1	2018-536	3903 N ST MARYS - SAN ANTONIO ZOO
2	2018-538	430 AUSTIN
3	2018-532	830 W COMMERCE
5	2018-537	517 BURLESON
6	2018-545	ROW at BUENA VISTA, DOLOROSA, FRIO, and SANTA ROSA
7	2018-233	3200 MCCOLLOUGH
8	2018-546	1138 IOWA - CERTIFICATION

9	2018-547	1138 IOWA - VERIFICATION
10	2018-552	615 ELEANOR - CERTIFICATION
11	2018-553	615 ELEANOR - VERIFICATION
12	2018-554	623 ELEANOR
13	2018-543	427 ADAMS
14	2018-505	1322 MCKINLEY
16	2018-526	111 FORCKE - CERTIFICATION
17	2018-527	111 FORCKE - VERIFICATION
18	2018-528	1032 DAWSON
19	2018-539	418 DONALDSON
20	2018-549	311 W HUISACHE
22	2018-507	614 BARBE
40	2018-530	520 DAWSON

Item #4 and #15 were moved to individual consideration by staff as there were Citizens to be Heard.
Item #22 and 40 were moved to the consent agenda by the applicant and the case manager.
Item #21 was moved to individual consideration by the applicant.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Garza and seconded by Laffoon to approve the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	1	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	2	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
4	2018-208	802 NOLAN

APPLICANT:

Jenny Hernandez

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a single family, residential structure on the vacant lot at 802 Nolan Street, in the Dignowity Hill Historic District. The proposed new construction is to feature one story in height and a detached garage.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through m with the following stipulations. Updated construction documents should be submitted to staff that note compliance with each stipulation prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

- i. That a setback be utilized that is greater than or equal to those found historically on the block, on Nolan. The proposed garage should feature a setback that is greater than the adjacent historic structure on N Olive.
- ii. That the applicant ensure that a foundation height of at least one (1) foot is used as noted in finding e.
- iii. That the applicant add additional fenestration to locations currently featuring blank walls, specifically the kitchen on the west elevation beneath the wraparound porch.
- iv. That the proposed aluminum clad wood windows feature dark colors and a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and an architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening. Additionally, staff finds that a one over one window would be most appropriate for the Dignowity Hill Historic District.
- v. That the rear garage feature metal or wood doors.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Valerie Cortez, 508 Lamar, in support with comments

Gary Houston with concerns

COMMISSION ACTION:

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	2	
Edward Garza (D3)	1	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
15	2018-534	421 HAYS

APPLICANT:

Juan Fernandez

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install an airstream trailer in the rear yard at 421 Hays Street.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through d with the stipulation that the applicant comply with all Development Services Department requirements regarding permitting.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Valerie Cortez, 508 Lamar, in opposition

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Wolff to approve with staff stipulations.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)		x
Edward Garza (D3)	2	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	1	
Matthew Bowman (D8)		x
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)		x
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

End of consent agenda.

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

Item #	Case #	Address
21	2018-548	330 E MYRTLE

Moved to Individual Consideration by the applicant.

APPLICANT:

Jorge Acosta

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Enclose an existing front door opening with siding.
2. Replace original one over one windows that are missing or deteriorated beyond repair.
3. Modify an original window opening.
4. Install a new front porch railing.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Item 1, Staff does not recommend approval of the enclosure of an existing door opening with siding based on findings a and b. Staff recommends that the existing opening be retained in place. The replacement of the other existing front door with a more stylistically appropriate wood door is eligible for administrative approval.

Item 2 and 3, Staff recommends approval of the window replacement based on finding c with the following stipulations:

- i. That the existing opening size be retained. A new window installed in this location should match the existing dimensions of the opening.
- ii. That the applicant submits a final window specification to staff for review and approval. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and

architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

Item 4, Staff recommends approval of the front porch railing installation with the stipulation that the applicant submits final dimensioned drawings to staff for review and approval prior to receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Ricki Kushner, of THCA, in opposition

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Deny 1, 2-4, item 5 repair and rebuild chimney, and item 6 and add needed column with staff approving documents.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	1	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	2	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #22 was moved to the consent agenda by the applicant and the case manager.

Item #	Case #	Address
23	2018-491	1010 N HACKBERRY

APPLICANT:

Cory Johnson

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Construct 337 square foot addition rear addition.
- 2) Relocate the set of arched casement windows 8 inches to the rear.
- 3) Relocate the set of square picture windows to the rear.
- 4) Relocate the set of double-hung windows to the rear addition.
- 5) Install new door opening to flank an existing window on the rear side-facing gable.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Item 1. Staff recommends approval of the rear addition based on findings b through j with the following stipulations:

- i. That the addition does not alter the existing rear gable and features an inset ridge condition and vertical trim piece to distinguish between new and old forms.
- ii. That all new windows in the addition adhere to the standard specifications: *Meeting rails that are no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and an architecturally appropriate sill*

detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

Item 2, 3, and 4. Staff does not recommend approval of any window relocation based on finding k and l. The windows should be restored or repaired in-place.

Item 5. Staff recommends approval of the new door and opening as proposed based on finding m.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Valerie Cortez, 508 Lamar, in support

Arvis Holland, 1112 Burnet, in support

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approved as submitted.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	1	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	2	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
24	2018-531	912 DAWSON

APPLICANT:

Joseph Turner

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

1. Construct a two story, multi-family residential structure to address Dawson Street.
2. Construct a one story, single-family residential structure at the rear of the lot at the intersection of Florence and Wheeler Alleys.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. Staff recommends conceptual approval of the proposed site plan as it relates to the proposed new construction described in request item #1 with the following stipulations:
 - i. That the applicant provide a site plan noting additional historic structures on this block of Dawson to confirm that a setback that is equal to or greater than those found historically on the block is used as noted in finding 1b.
 - ii. That the applicant propose a foundation height that is consistent with the Guidelines as noted in finding 1e.
 - iii. That the proposed materials follow the specifications outlined in finding 1i.
 - iv. That the applicant install wood or aluminum clad wood windows that feature meeting rails that are no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and an architecturally appropriate sill

detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

v. That additional window openings be included into the proposed design and that the applicant address window proportions as noted in finding 1k.

Prior to receiving a recommendation for conceptual approval, staff finds that the applicant should provide additional information regarding the proposed massing as it relates to the heights of the historic structures found on this block of Dawson. A to-scale street elevation should be provided

2. Staff recommends conceptual approval of the proposed site plan and massing as they relate to the proposed new construction described in request item #2 with the following stipulations:

i. That the applicant propose a foundation height that is consistent with the Guidelines as noted in finding 2e.

ii. That the proposed materials follow the specifications outlined in finding 2h.

iii. That the applicant install wood or aluminum clad wood windows that feature meeting rails that are no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and an architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

iv. That the applicant address window proportions as noted in finding 2j.

v. That the proposed parking location at the corner of Wheeler Alley and Florence Street be relocated or eliminated as noted in finding 2k.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Valerie Cortez, 508 Lamar, in support with comments

Arvis Holland, 1112 Burnet, in support with comments

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approval with all staff stipulations.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	2	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	1	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
25	2018-566	126, 130, 134 SWISS

APPLICANT:

Ricardo Turrubiates/Terramark

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct four structures on the vacant lots addressed as 126, 130 and 134 N Swiss. These units comprise phase 1 of this development. Each structure is to feature three stories in height.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through p with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant confirm foundation heights as noted in finding i.
- ii. That double-hung, one-over-one wood windows or aluminum-clad wood windows be used. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail (need to add detail here). Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- iii. That the applicant study revising the proposed mansard roof to a flat roof with a parapet wall as noted in findings j and k.
- iv. That all mechanical equipment be screened from view at the public right of way.
- v. That fenestration or architectural detailing be added to all exposed elevations.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Valerie Cortez, 508 Lamar, in opposition, support staff comments

Arvis Holland, 1112 Burnet, in support

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approval with stipulations 1-4.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	1	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	2	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
26	2018-411	909 N PINE

APPLICANT:

Ricardo Turrubiates/Terramark

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a two story, single family residential structure on the vacant lot at 909 N Pine, located within the Dignowity Hill Historic District.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on finding a through o with the following stipulations:

i. That a double-hung, one-over-one wood windows or aluminum-clad wood windows be used.. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25” and stiles no wider than 2.25”. White manufacturer’s color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail (need to add detail here). Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

ii. That the proposed lap siding feature a smooth finish and an exposure of four (4) inches and that the proposed standing seam metal roof feature panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches in height a crimped ridge seam or low provide ridge cap and a standard galvalume finish.

iii. That the applicant add additional fenestration to the rear façade and add fenestration to both side facades that include full height windows as noted in finding i. The fenestration added should feature a traditional profile with a sash window. A foundation inspection must be scheduled with Office of Historic Preservation staff to verify setbacks and foundation heights prior to the start of foundation installation. A roofing inspection must be schedule with Office of Historic Preservation staff to verify roofing materials and to insure that an unapproved ridge cap is not installed.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Valerie Cortez, 508 Lamar, in support

Arvis Holland, 1112 Burnet, in support

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approval with all staff stipulations.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	1	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	2	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzner, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
27	2018-522	255, 259 BRAHAN

APPLICANT:

Ricardo Turrubiates/Terramark

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval of a site plan for two, multi-family residential structures to be located on two individual lots at the corner of Brahan Boulevard and Haywood Avenue in the

Westfort Historic District. As currently proposed, one structure is to address Brahan while the other is to address Haywood.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval at this time. Staff recommends that the applicant address the following items prior to receiving a recommendation of conceptual approval from staff.

- i. That the applicant provide information regarding front yard setbacks on Brahan, and that that setback feature a depth of at least 45 feet as noted in finding e.
- ii. A minimum spacing of 25 feet between the proposed homes should be maintained as noted in finding i.
- iii. That the applicant proposed a setback on Haywood that is greater than the side setback of the adjacent historic structure (at the corner of Haywood and Army Blvd.) for both the front setback of the structure that fronts

Haywood and the side setback of the structure that fronts Brahan.

- iv. That the proposed carport to the side (west) of the structure fronting Brahan be repositioned to a location that is consistent with the locations of accessory structures found historically throughout the district (rear yard) as noted in finding n.
- v. That the applicant reduce the amount of hardscaping found on site or reduce the proposed width of the alley access point as noted in findings l and m.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Patti Ziontz, 107 King William, in opposition

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Referred to the Design Review Committee.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	1	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	2	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
35	2018-523	1434 SE MILITARY

Item moved earlier on the agenda to accommodate for applicant.

APPLICANT:

Gary Johnson/Signs Plus

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install signage at 1434 SE Military Drive.

Within this request, the applicant has proposed the following:

1. One (1) internally illuminated, channel letter sign to feature an overall length of 9' – 8 3/8" and an overall height of 2' – 6 1/4" for a total size of 24/17 square feet. The proposed signage will read "Watershed Carwash" and will be installed on the north elevation.

2. One (1) double sided, monument sign to feature an overall height of 15' – 0" and an overall width of 11' – 6". The proposed monument sign will be internally illuminated and will read "\$3, Car Wash, Free Vacuums and Watershed". This sign will feature an overall size of 253 square feet, including both sides.
3. Three (3) double sided, monument signs to feature an overall height of 3' – 0" and an overall width of 2' – 2" to read "Enter", "Thank you, Have a Great Day" and "Free Vacuum". These signs will feature an overall size of approximately 10 square feet, including both sides.
4. Two (2) wall mounted panel signs to feature an overall width of 5' – 0" and an overall height of 1' – 6". One sign is to read "Cash & Credit" and the other is to read "Fast Pass Members". Both signs are to be non-illuminated and feature a total of 7.5 square feet each.
5. Two (2) wall mounted signs for vending and restrooms. These signs will feature an overall width of 3' – 4 ½" and an overall height of 1' – 6". These signs will be non-illuminated and will feature a total size of approximately 4.9 square feet each.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. Staff recommends approval of the proposed wall sign in request item #1 with the stipulation that the sign feature reverse channel letters and an indirect lighting source as noted in finding b.
2. Staff does not recommend approval of the proposed monument sign in request item #2. Staff finds that a monument sign that features no more than five (5) feet in height and an overall square footage that does not exceed fifty (50) square feet should be proposed as noted in finding c.
3. Staff recommends approval of the proposed directional monument signs in request item #3 with the stipulation that the proposed signs feature indirect lighting and metal faces.
4. Staff recommends approval of the proposed kiosk signage in request item #4 as submitted.
5. Staff recommends approval of the proposed vending and restroom signage in request item #5 as submitted.

The illegal, unapproved flag signage located on site is to be removed as a stipulation of any approval issued by the Commission for the request items.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

None.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approval with all staff stipulations.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	1	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	2	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzner, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
28	2018-533	355 TRAIL

APPLICANT:

Katie Bingham, AIA/Mark Odom Studio

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to construct twenty-three condominium units on the vacant lot located at 355 Trail. The property features lots that are located within the River Improvement Overlay only, as well as those that are located within both the River Improvement Overlay and the River Road Historic District. The applicant has proposed for the condominium units to feature three stories in height. Access to the site will be provided from Trail Street and Huisache Street.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend conceptual approval at this time. Staff recommends that the applicant reduce the amount of the proposed units. This would reduce potential damage to the acequia as well as promote efficient traffic flow and emergency vehicle flow throughout the property. Additionally, the reduction of units would produce an overall site plan that features a lot coverage that is consistent with the Guidelines and the historic development pattern found throughout the River Road Historic District.

Additionally, staff recommends that the applicant reduce the height of the proposed units on Trail by one story as well as the westernmost unit on Huisache by one story. This would provide height and massing transitions from the proposed taller structures at the center of the site to shorter structures that exist currently on Huisache and south of Trail.

In addition to the above recommendations, staff finds that the applicant should address the following items prior to receiving conceptual approval:

- i. That the applicant incorporate additional setback depth on Huisach as noted in finding e.
- ii. That foundation heights that are comparable to those found within the district and consistent with the Guidelines be proposed as noted in finding h.
- iii. That the proposed front loaded garages be eliminated.
- iv. That the applicant incorporate architectural details that are more consistent with the historic precedent found in the district, including roof profiles, porch profiles and façade depth.
- v. That the applicant incorporate additional front porch detailing and massing as noted in finding l.
- vi. That a double-hung, aluminum-clad wood window should be used. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening. The recessing of windows at least two inches within walls is also a requirement of the UDC Section 35-674.
- vii. That all mechanical and service equipment be screened from view at the public right of way.
- viii. That additional landscaping materials be incorporated into the design as noted in finding s.
- ix. **ARCHAEOLOGY**- An archaeological investigation is required. The archaeological scope of work should be submitted to the OHP archaeologists for review and approval prior to beginning the archaeological investigation. The development project shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, rules, and regulations regarding archaeology.
- x. That a detailed construction management plan should be developed and provided prior to final approval that includes the limits of construction in proximity to the historic acequia and measures taken to mitigate potential impacts during construction.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Richard Reed, (time yielded to him by Barbara Witte Howell and Myfee Moore)

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Referred to the Design Review Committee.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	1	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	

Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	2	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Commissioner Laffoon departed at 6:15 pm

Item #	Case #	Address
29	2018-525	115 DEVINE

APPLICANT:

Brian Voges/Voges Design, LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to construct five, two-story, multi-use structures on the vacant lot at 115 Devine, located within the Lavaca Historic District.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend conceptual approval at this time. Staff recommends that the applicant address the following items prior to receiving a recommendation for conceptual approval.

- i. That a building to lot ration that is more consistent with that found historically in the district and the Guidelines be proposed as noted in finding e.
- ii. That the applicant proposed a front setback that is greater than the setbacks of the historic structures on the block as noted in finding f.
- iii. That the applicant provide additional information, such as a street elevation to address the proposed height being inconsistent with the historic heights found on the block.
- iv. That the applicant propose a foundation height that is consistent with the Guidelines as noted in finding i.
- v. That the applicant eliminate the proposed flat roofs and incorporate a roof form that is complementary of those found historically in the district as noted in finding j.
- vi. That the applicant proposed architectural elements, particularly those pertaining to roof forms and front façade massing and arrangement that are complementary of the historic architectural elements and massing found in the district as noted in finding k.
- vii. That the applicant utilize materials that are consistent with the Guidelines as noted in finding l.
- viii. That a double-hung, one-over-one wood windows or aluminum-clad wood windows be used.. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25” and stiles no wider than 2.25”. White manufacturer’s color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail (need to add detail here). Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- ix. That all mechanical equipment be screened from view from the public right of way as noted in finding n.
- x. That a landscaping plan be submitted that is consistent with the Guidelines as noted in finding q.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

None.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Conceptually approve of the submission presented with stipulations 2 through 10 still in place.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	2	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	1	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)		x
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
30	2018-455	919 E CROCKETT

APPLICANT:

Amber Caddell/Design Tech Homes

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a 2-story single family residential structure on the vacant lot addressed 919 E Crockett St.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends final approval based on findings a through r with the following stipulations:

i. That the applicant explores 1.5 story massing to be more consistent with the development pattern of the block as noted in finding d and submits a final, detailed, and accurate height study that places the proposed new construction in context with the existing historic structures on the block. Updated elevations must be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

ii. That the applicant installs wood or aluminum-clad wood windows in lieu of the proposed vinyl windows and submits a final window specification to staff for review and approval. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening. The paired windows must feature a true ganged condition.

iii. That the proposed driveway measure 10 feet in width and the proposed apron measure 12 feet in width at its widest point. If any modifications are to occur to the submitted site plan, the applicant must submit updates for review and approval.

iv. That the front porch columns measure 6x6" in width as noted in finding n. Updated elevations must be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Valerie Cortez, 508 Lamar, in support

Arvis Holland, 1112 Burnet, in support

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approval with stipulations 2, 3 and 4.

	Aye	Nay
--	-----	-----

Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	2	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	1	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
31	2018-496	122 HEIMAN

APPLICANT:

Richard Hope/RC Hope Group, LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct an exterior stair on the west façade from the third story to the ground level. This addition will require the modification of an existing window opening into a door opening with a transom window.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through c with the stipulation that the applicant revise the proposed staircase to feature a structural system that does not require penetrations into the historic façade.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

None.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approval with all staff stipulations.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	1	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	2	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
32	2018-481	1811 N PALMETTO

APPLICANT:

Diana Orosco

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace the existing, standing seam metal roof with an asphalt shingle roof.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval based on finding b. Staff recommends that a standing seam metal roof be installed to feature panels that are 18 to 21 inches in width, seams that are 1 to 2 inches in height, a crimped ridge seam and a standard galvalume finish.

A roof inspection is to be scheduled with OHP staff 24 hours prior to the start of roof replacement to ensure that a crimped ridge seam is to be installed.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Rose M Hill, President of the Government Hill Alliance Neighborhood Association

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Denial.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	1	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzner, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
33	2018-097	808 E CARSON

APPLICANT:

REQUEST:

RECOMMENDATIONS:

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Denise Homer, 821 Mason, received 6 minutes from Todd Mernin and Antonio Infante, in opposition

Cindy Tower, received 3 minutes from Mary Briscoe Cushman, in opposition

Charles Massey, absent

John Murillo, absent

Raul Saucedo, in opposition

Mark Homer, 821 Mason, in opposition

Patti Ziontaz, SA Conservation Society, 107 King William in opposition

Patti Henkley in opposition

Rose Hill, Government Hill Alliance Neighborhood Association, in support

Stella Ashley, absent

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approval of staff 2, 3, and on item #1 verify with staff and submit design porch elements and screen details to staff.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	2	
Edward Garza (D3)	1	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	

Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
34	2018-529	4002 BROADWAY

APPLICANT:

Jason Kaupert/General Signs

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a new pylon sign at 4002 Broadway to feature an overall height of fourteen (14) feet and an overall width of eight (8) feet. The proposed sign will feature internal illumination, routed out graphics and metal faces. The applicant has noted that the existing, pole sign and an abandoned pole at the corner of the lot will be removed.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval based on finding b. Staff recommends that the applicant proposed a monument sign that does not exceed fifty (50) square feet in size, including both sides and does not exceed six (6) feet in height.

The abandoned pole sign near the corner of Broadway and Carnahan should be removed per UDC Section 35-678(k)(5).

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

None.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Denial.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)		x
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)		x
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	1	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item#35 was heard earlier on the agenda.

Item #	Case #	Address
36	2018-555	3122 ROOSEVELT

APPLICANT:

Gus Saadi/Xpress Signs

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a new wall-mounted sign on the building located at 3122 Roosevelt Ave. The applicant has provided two options for consideration, with option number one preferred:

1. A wall-mounted, internally illuminated cabinet sign totaling approximately 33 square feet.

2. A wall-mounted, non-illuminated, flat-cut aluminum sign totaling approximately 31 square feet.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends Option 2, the installation of a non-illuminated aluminum wall panel sign, based on findings a through c.

Staff does not find Option 1, the installation of an internally-illuminated cabinet sign, to be consistent with the Guidelines.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

None.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Not applicable. The item was withdrawn by the applicant.

Item #	Case #	Address
37	2018-389	102 LOVERA

APPLICANT:

Mayes White

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a new 10 foot wide driveway and curb cut in the front yard of 102 Lovera Blvd.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a through b.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

None.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Denial.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	2	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	1	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
38	2018-541	235 YELLOWSTONE

APPLICANT:

Daniel and Paulina Minesinger

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a determination of contributing status for the main structure located at 235 Yellowstone.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff finds the structure to be contributing to the Mission Historic District based on findings a through c.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Patti Ziontz, San Antonio Conservation Society, 107 King William, in opposition.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Postponed to the next HDRC hearing since the applicant is not present.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	1	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
39	2018-551	429 MADISON

APPLICANT:

Jay Monday

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a wrought iron fence in the front yard to feature four feet in height and a driveway gate.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on finding b through d with the following stipulations:

- i. The fence should turn at the driveway to meet at the corner of the structure, as opposed to spanning across the driveway in the front.
- ii. The driveway gate should be located behind the front façade plane of the structure or removed from the design.
- iii. That no portion of the fence exceed four feet in height.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

None.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approval with stipulation 3, for the height to not exceed 4 feet.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	1	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	2	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #40 was moved to the consent agenda by the applicant and the case manager.

Item #	Case #	Address
--------	--------	---------

41	2018-544	832 E GUENTHER
----	----------	----------------

APPLICANT:

Rodrigo Lillo

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to amend a previously issued Certificate of Appropriateness for the re-roofing of a standing-seam metal roof to include the installation of a ridge cap.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of the ridge cap as proposed based on finding c. Staff recommends the installation of a thin ridge cap that mimics the form of a crimped ridge when a standard crimped/double-munch ridge is not feasible.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

None.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Denial.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	2	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	1	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	x	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzner, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Case #	Address
43	2018-444	1411 W ASHBY PL - BEACON HILL ELEMENTARY

APPLICANT:

Office of Historic Preservation

OWNER:

James McKnight, 122 E Pecan, representing property owner.

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Finding of Historic Significance for the property located at 1411 W Ashby Place. The focus of the finding and the contributing resource at 1411 W Ashby is the Beacon Hill Elementary School #22 built in 1915.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Patti Zaiontz, San Antonio Conservation Society, 107 King William, in support.
 Jacklyn Landaverde, receives 3 minutes from Michelle Nauman, in opposition.
 Amanda Montes Gonzalez, receives 3 minutes from Heather Lopez, in opposition.
 Joyce Hernandez-Kelley, receives 3 minutes from Janet Guel, in opposition.
 Victoria Cavazos, receives 3 minutes from Marisa Barrera, in opposition.
 Christine Martinez, SAISD School Board Member of District 6, in opposition.
 Cynthia Spielman of Beacon Hill Alliance Neighborhood Association, in opposition.
 Devyn Gonzalez, receives 3 minutes from Ernesto Gonzalez, in opposition.
 Laryn Nelson, receives 3 minutes from Magda Farigs, in opposition.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approval of the Historic and Design Review Commission Meeting minutes from October 17, 2018.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	1	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Move to adjourn.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	1	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	
John Laffoon (D10)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 9:22 PM.

APPROVED


Michael Guarino
Chair

Julia Grizzard, 258 Gazelle Drive, rep of Diego Bernal, in opposition.

Daniel Ortiz, 112 E Pecan, in opposition.

Patti Raddle, President of SAISD, in opposition.

Pablo Escamilla, General Counsel for SAISD, in opposition.

Kamal, Superintendent for Beacon Hill Elementary, in opposition.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approval of a Finding of Historic Significance.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	1	
Sandi Wolff (D2)		x
Edward Garza (D3)	x	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)		x
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)		x
Matthew Bowman (D8)	2	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Item #	Address
42	MISSION HISTORIC DISTRICT DESIGN MANUAL

APPLICANT:

Office of Historic Preservation

REQUEST:

The Office of Historic Preservation is requesting a recommendation of approval for the proposed Mission Historic District Design Manual. As an addition to the existing Historic District Design Guidelines, the Mission Manual is a set of district specific guidelines to be applied to designated structures in and the World Heritage Buffer Zone that includes the Mission Historic District.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

The Office of Historic Preservation recommends approval for the adoption of the Mission Historic District Design Manual into the Unified Development Code and requests a recommendation of approval for adoption to the Zoning Commission and to City Council based on findings a through i.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Patti Zaiontz, San Antonio Conservation Society, 107 King William, in support.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion: Approval.

	Aye	Nay
Curtis Fish (D1)	x	
Sandi Wolff (D2)	x	
Edward Garza (D3)	1	
Martha Martinez-Flores (D5)	x	
Scott Carpenter (D6)	x	
Anne-Marie Grube (D7)	2	
Matthew Bowman (D8)	x	
Jeff Fetzer, VC (D9)	x	

THE MOTION CARRIED.